

The Corporation of the Township of Brock

Special Council Minutes

July 25, 2022 Virtual Meeting

Members Present:	Mayor John Grant
	Regional Councillor Ted Smith
	Ward 1 Councillor Michael Jubb
	Ward 2 Councillor Claire Doble
	Ward 3 Councillor Walter Schummer
	Ward 4 Councillor Cria Pettingill
	Ward 5 Councillor Lynn Campbell
Staff Present:	CAO Ingrid Svelnis
	Clerk/Deputy CAO Fernando Lamanna
	Deputy Clerk Janean Currie
	Clerk's Assistant, Stefanie Stickwood
	Supervisor By-law Enforcement and Animal Control Sarah Jones

1. Call to Order - 3:00 p.m.

Mayor Grant called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m. and a quorum was present.

Holly Eade, By-law Enforcement Officer joined the meeting at 3:00 p.m.

Mayor Grant provided the procedures for Appeal Hearing as filed under By-law No. 2446-2012-PP by Veronica Mirela Spineanu, B25320 Maple Beach Road for an order issued to restrain her dogs with respect to an incident which occurred on June 9, 2022.

- Ada, 2 year old female Dutch Shepherd, and
- Luca, male, black and white mixed breed

2. Land Acknowledgement

It is important to begin each public gathering with a Land and Territorial Acknowledgement, to recognize the Indigenous people for being good stewards of the land and environment, here where we are meeting today. The Township of Brock has traditionally been a hunting and fishing ground for First Nations people. We reside on and benefit from the Williams Treaty Territories, on the land of the Mississaugas and Chippewas. May we share the land as long as the sun rises, the grass grows and river flows.

3. Disclosure of Pecuniary Interest and Nature Thereof

None

4. Evidence Provided by Township Staff

Mayor Grant requested confirmation of the ownership of the dogs to which the Veronica Spineanu, appellant, affirmed that she is the owner.

By-law Officer Holly Eade provided the following evidence:

- June 9, 2022, 3:00 pm dog on dog attack in the roadway at B25320 Maple Beach Road - Ada attacked Lucky (chihuahua)
- 2 year old Luca did not attack Lucky, but was running at large and interfering with the victim
- the owner regained control of her 2 dogs, removed them to the house, and enquired about the injured dog
- intense veterinary care was provided for Lucky
- received witness statements for the attack
- Ada was quarantined by Durham Health Department for delivering a bite and scratch to the owner of Lucky during the attack
- June 17, 2022 served the dog owner with two Part 1 fines and an order to restrain both dogs
- subsequent concerns have been received about the incident

Council members enquired about previous orders served on the owner of the dogs.

Resolution: SPC-2022-182

Moved by Councillor Jubb **Seconded by** Regional Councillor Ted Smith

BE IT RESOLVED THAT Council break for a recess at 3:12 p.m. and reconvene at 3:17 p.m.

CARRIED

5. Evidence Provided by Appellant

Mayor Grant reconvened the meeting at 3:24 p.m. and a quorum was present.

Owner/Appellant Veronica Mirela Spineanu was in attendance together with her agent, Tonya Sellers, Paralegal Representative.

Tonya Sellers provided the following evidence:

- video footage showing the appellant arriving home in her vehicle and stopping to open the gate, the dogs remained in the locked vehicle momentarily, the dogs escaped from the back hatch of the vehicle (stepped on the control button) while the appellant was opening the gate, and Ada attacking Lucky
- Luca did not engage in the attack
- the appellant regained control of the dogs and removed them to her house
- extra fencing and privacy screening was installed on the appellant's property to secure any gaps in the fence
- appellant agrees with the muzzle order while outside of the property
- the appellant covered the expenses of the injured dog
- Ada is a rescued dog found on a trail with signs of neglect, and has had K9 training
- the muzzle causes injuries on Ada's snout

Ms. Sellers advised that the appellant is requesting relief from the section of the order to muzzle the dogs while the dogs are under supervision in the secured fenced yard.

Council members enquired as to previous occurrences of the dogs being off the property without supervision, the effectiveness and type of the K9 training,

whether the dogs could escape the property when the driveway gate is open, whether the lakefront of the property is secure, and what other human interaction the dog has experienced.

6. Witnesses Wishing to Speak and/or Providing Written Statements

Mayor Grant opened the meeting to witnesses for their statements.

6.1 Mary Antolak

Verbal statement included the following points:

- no progress has been made in preventing these dogs from attacking innocent people
- lives on the same street, and has had involvement with one of the dogs
- referenced/read the two complaints she submitted last year to the Township By-law department
- expressed concern for the safety of family and neighbours
- feels unsafe walking in the area, emotional trauma
- does not support the request for relief in muzzle order

6.2 Martha McKinnon

Verbal statement included the following points:

- neighbour of the appellant
- the majority of the appellant's property is secured by a chainlink fence, however the waterfront is not secure
- Ada escaped the fence on 2 occasions
- cannot let her own dogs roam on her property for fear of attack
- kept a log of incidents/altercations before and after the order was served on the appellant
- provided By-law staff with photos of Ada in the yard unmuzzled after the order was served
- a DOLA order would be preferred as opposed to the order written under the Municipal By-law
- does not support the request for relief in the muzzle order

6.3 Maurice Guillemette

Verbal statement included the following points:

- expressed concern for the temperament of Ada
- April 2021 an altercation with Ada while installing a cedar hedge bit his hip and ripped his pants, scabbing and bruising occurred appellant could not contain Ada at that time
- Ada has escaped the property on previous occasions and has bitten people
- does not support the request for relief of the muzzle order
- Ada should be supervised at all times while outside
- 6.4 Gloria Leibel

Verbal statement included the following points:

- neighbour of the appellant, shares the beach
- altercation with Ada while at her dock
- expressed concern for her visiting grandchildren
- the dog is not suited to live in this community

6.5 Loretta Lampert

Verbal statement included the following points:

- neighbour of the appellant
- dog handler/licenced dog kennel provider
- witness to the June 9 attack, arrived at the scene as the appellant was restraining her dogs
- emotional trauma
- witnessed an altercation, summer 2021, between a neighbour and Ada
- has been bit by Ada while muzzled, bit by Luca, bruising occurred
- does not support the request for relief of the muzzle order, would prefer the highest restrictions imposed to ensure a safe community
- 6.6 Terri Donovan

Verbal statement included the following points:

- lives on the same street
- neighbours are now carrying weapons for protection
- while walking her own dog, witnessed Ada in a state of agitation within the appellant's property
- witnessed the dogs loose on the beach, unmuzzled
- 6.7 Cynthia and Carl Ray

The Clerk/Deputy CAO read the written statement which included:

- live on Maple Beach Road
- oppose the request for relief of the muzzle order
- expressed concern for the safety of the community
- these dogs are a hazard to the community and must be muzzled
- 6.8 Maxine Terzis

The Clerk/Deputy CAO read the written statement which included:

- the victim of the attack on June 9, 2022
- emotionally traumatized
- Lucky is recouperating, both dogs skittish now
- Ada is dangerous, can inflict serious injury
- supports restrictions on the dogs
- 6.9 Gilbert Nefsky

The Clerk/Deputy CAO read the written statement which included:

- lives on the same street, legally blind, has a service dog
- expressed concern for an attack on his service dog while he is walking as he would not be able to provide any defense
- request that the restraining order be maintained
- 6.10 Kelsie Cotton

The Clerk/Deputy CAO read the written statement which included:

- lives on Maple Beach Road
- experienced an altercation in June 2021 between Luca and her own dog while walking bruising and a scratch on her ankle
- filed a report of the incident with Brock and with the Region of Durham
- expressed fear that Ada could escape the house and property when unsupervised
- Ada and Luca bark with their heads under the gate, aggressive behaviour
- feelings of anxiety when in that area of the community and can no longer walk that way to visit family
- supports the conditions of the restraining order

7. Committee Deliberation

Mayor Grant opened the meeting for a final statement from the appellant.

Tonya Sellers, representative for the appellant, provide the following comments:

- incidents referred to in the witness statements should have been reported
- the appellant is willing to provide reinforcement to secure the yard
- request the muzzle order be amended to allow for the dog to be unmuzzled on the property while fully supervised

Trevor Gronden provided the following comments:

- partner of Ms Spineanu
- Ada is puppy-like, has triggers when there is movement and settles down after the initial trigger
- my family provides support for Ada
- continue to communicate with the neighbours
- implemented many suggestions to secure property
- Ada has shown improvement over the past 4 months needs to exercise without a muzzle while outdoors on the property

8. Closed Session

Resolution: SPC-2022-183

Moved by Regional Councillor Ted Smith **Seconded by** Councillor Campbell

BE IT RESOLVED THAT Council proceed into a Closed Meeting of Municipal Council at 4:55 p.m. to discuss the following matters:

 pursuant to Section 239(2)(e) of the Municipal Act, litigation or potential litigation, including matters before administrative tribunals, affecting the municipality or local board with respect to an Order to Restrain

CARRIED

8.1 Appeal filed by Veronica Spineanu

9. Rise from Closed Session

Mayor Grant reconvened the meeting at 5:33 p.m. and a quorum was present.

Councillor Jubb requested a recorded vote.

Resolution: SPC-2022-184

Moved by Councillor Pettingill Seconded by Councillor Doble

BE IT RESOLVED THAT Council uphold the Order to Restrain Dog(s) made against Veronica Mirela Spineanu of B25320 Maple Beach Road, Beaverton for the dogs identified as "Ada" (subject dog 1) and "Luca" (subject dog 2) along with all conditions as outlined in the order dated June 15, 2022 and served on June 17, 2022.

Yes (7): Mayor Grant, Regional Councillor Ted Smith, Councillor Jubb, Councillor Doble, Councillor Schummer, Councillor Pettingill, and Councillor Campbell

CARRIED (7 to 0)

10. Confirmation By-law

By-law Number 3141-2022 - to confirm the proceedings of the Council of the Corporation of the Township of Brock at its meeting held on July 25, 2022.

Resolution: SPC-2022-185

Moved by Councillor Campbell Seconded by Councillor Schummer BE IT RESOLVED THAT By-law Number 3141-2022, being a By-law to confirm the proceedings of the Council of the Corporation of the Township of Brock at its meeting held on July 25, 2022 be taken as read, enacted and signed by the Mayor and Clerk/Deputy CAO.

CARRIED

11. Adjournment

Resolution: SPC-2022-186

Moved by Councillor Campbell Seconded by Regional Councillor Ted Smith

BE IT RESOLVED THAT the meeting of Council adjourn at this time 5:38 p.m.

CARRIED

Mayor

Clerk